

How do historians construct arguments?

Objective:

- Identify the components of a historical argument.



Introduction

→ Directions: Read through the two arguments below. List three differences and similarities between Argument A and Argument B.

Categorize

| Argument A | Argument B |
|--|--|
| <p>Malcolm: Fast food is better than home cooked food.</p> <p>Brittany: Why do you say that?</p> <p>Malcolm: I like it.</p> <p>Brittany: How can you prove that?</p> <p>Malcolm: When I eat it, I say "Mmmmmm, good and greasy!"</p> <p>Brittany: So, what?</p> <p>Malcolm: So, that's why it's better. It tastes better to me.</p> | <p>Aliyah: Home cooked food is better than fast food.</p> <p>Johnny: Why do you say that?</p> <p>Aliyah: Home cooked food is healthier for you.</p> <p>Johnny: How can you prove that?</p> <p>Aliyah: In an experiment, researchers found that on average, home cooked burgers have four less calories per ounce than fast food burgers.</p> <p>Johnny: So, what?</p> <p>Aliyah: The more calories you eat, the more likely you are to be overweight.</p> <p>Johnny: So, what?</p> <p>Aliyah: The more overweight you are, the more likely it is that you will have health problems like heart disease, or a heart attack. Therefore, home cooked meals are healthier than fast food meals.</p> |

List three differences and similarities between Argument A and Argument B.

| Similarities | Differences |
|---|---|
| <p>- Arguing over food</p> <p>- Each has a claim.</p> | <p>Claims are different.</p> <p>A- fast food better</p> <p>B- home cooked better</p> <p>A B has more evidence + facts. A only has opinion.</p> |

Constructing Arguments is the act of creating persuasive understandings of the past by using relevant evidence from primary and secondary sources.



Construct
Arguments

A historical argument **IS NOT**:

- supported by opinions.
- made up on the spot.
- won by the person who can yell the loudest.

A historical argument **IS**:

- supported by information from reliable sources.
- researched and carefully put together.

Historians construct arguments through claims, evidence, and reasoning/explanation.

The Components of a Historical Argument

CLAIM: The claim is the answer to your research question or response to the prompt you are addressing. It should be based on the evidence you have collected.

EVIDENCE: Evidence is information that supports your claim. We collect evidence from sources like texts, videos, and knowledgeable people to support our reasons.

REASONING/EXPLANATION: Reasoning is the explanation for why the evidence supports the claim. In history we contextualize, compare, corroborate, connect cause and effect, and use geography and economic ideas to explain our reasoning.

Constructing Arguments Practice



Construct Arguments



Annotate

→ Directions: Reread the argument below from the introduction and annotate it using the symbols below to label the different components of the argument.

| Claim | Evidence | Reasoning |
|-------|----------|-----------|
|-------|----------|-----------|

C

E

R

Aliyah: Home cooked food is healthier for you. C

Johnny: Why do you say that? How can you prove that?

Aliyah: In an experiment, researchers found that on average, home cooked burgers have four less calories per ounce than fast food burgers. E

Johnny: So, what?

Aliyah: The more calories you eat, the more likely you are to be overweight. R

Johnny: So, what?

Aliyah: The more overweight you are, the more likely it is that you will have health problems like heart disease, or a heart attack. Therefore, home cooked meals are healthier than fast food meals. R



SQ 7: How do historians construct arguments?

→ Directions: Based on the information provided, respond to the prompts below.



Construct Arguments

1. Describe what a historical argument is. **2.** Identify the components of an historical argument.
 A historical argument is . . .
 The components of a historical argument are . . .



Categorize

Part II
 → Directions: Examine the statements below from the lunchroom fight between Justin and Max, then categorize each statement as a claim, evidence that supports that claim, or reasoning that supports the evidence. Place the letter corresponding with each statement in the appropriate place below. There will be only one claim.

| Statement Letter | Component | Statement |
|------------------|---|--|
| _____ | Claim | A. Megan, Max’s girlfriend said that Max had been acting strange and “kind of mean.” |
| _____ | Evidence #1 | B. Justin’s father knows him better than anyone else, so if he believes his son is not capable of starting a fight, then Max probably started it. |
| _____ | Reasoning/explanation in Support of Evidence #1 | C. Max started the fight, not Justin. |
| _____ | Evidence #2 | D. If Max had been mean to Justin in line, that may have started the fight. |
| _____ | Reasoning/explanation in Support of Evidence #2 | E. Justin’s father said that his son “would never lay a finger on anyone unless he was really provoked” and that it was “really not in his nature” to “stir up trouble.” |